

Livestock Market Area Development Brief

WSP Group and Atisreal for Ryedale District Council
and Yorkshire Forward

QM

| Issue/revision | Issue 1 | Revision 1 | Revision 2 | Revision 3 |
|----------------|----------------|----------------|------------|------------|
| Remarks | | | | |
| Date | | 01/10/08 | | |
| Prepared by | Peter Farnham | Paul Comerford | | |
| Signature | | | | |
| Checked by | Stuart Baillie | Paul Comerford | | |
| Signature | | | | |
| Authorised by | Paul Comerford | Paul Comerford | | |
| Signature | | | | |
| Project number | 11140830/PT1 | 11140830/PT1 | | |
| File reference | | | | |

WSP Development and Transportation
Buchanan House
24-30 Holborn
London
EC1N 2HS

Tel: +44 (0)20 7314 5000
Fax: +44 (0)20 7314 5111
<http://www.wspgroup.com>

WSP UK Limited | Registered Address Buchanan House, 24-30 Holborn, London, EC1N 2HS, UK | Reg No. 01383511 England | WSP Group plc | Offices worldwide



Livestock Market Area

1.1 OVERVIEW

- Redevelopment of the Livestock Market area
- Dependent on relocation of Livestock Market within Malton
- Provision of new shops, services and housing
- Improved public realm
- Integration with surrounding areas
- Provision of new public car parking

1.2 SITE CONTEXT

Description of current site

The site straddles Horsemarket Road and Spital Street. Spital Street continues along to Wheelgate, connecting the area with Wentworth Street Car Park. In addition to these two streets, the site is bisected by the continuing right of way leading on from The Shambles. The Shambles is a collection of historic small shop units fronting onto a pedestrian thoroughfare which provides an attractive route between the Market Place and the Livestock Market area. In addition to The Shambles, a collection of alleyways / snickets connect the two areas.



The site's south-eastern edge sits directly on the back of Market Place properties that contains a limited amount of active frontages.


Malton and the Livestock Market's relationship are based on historical ties and the market's influence on the local economy, social activities and physical nature of the town centre.

The past ten years have seen a decline in livestock market trading within the UK. This is reflected in the farmers' questionnaire (detailed below) where 66% of farmers who use Malton's market, agreed that Malton's market has also shown levels of decline. Of the farmers who use the market, 100% stated that they make use of "other town centre facilities / services" in Malton suggesting that the market continues to have some impact on the local economy.

The Livestock Market continues to have an impact on the physical fabric of the town centre. Outside of market days and the monthly farmers' and poultry market, this key town centre site is underutilised and provides a poor quality built environment characterised by run-down buildings with open-air animal pens and informal piecemeal vehicle parking. However, important social links established within Malton over many years need to be maintained for the benefit of the farming community and town centre traders including local banks and associated services required on market days.

Current Use(s)

The Livestock Market area is currently used twice a week for livestock sales with additional events running throughout the year. Consultation responses have indicated a general decline in attendance since the outbreak of Foot and Mouth Disease in 2001.



The farmers' and poultry market takes place once a month within the main building to the south of the site.

Utilities and Servicing

Utility services are located under the roads within and along the site. Following consultations with farmers, it was noted that access to the site for larger vehicles is problematic and removes on-street parking facilities for local residents on market days. Some larger vehicles currently park on the upper level of Wentworth Street Car Park on market days.

1.3 PLANNING POLICY CONTEXT

Local Planning

Local Development Framework (LDF)

Considerable work was undertaken on the Ryedale LDF, however the Council's Core Strategy was found unsound on a limited number of issues in January 2007. Work is underway to prepare a revised Core Strategy, together with a Facilitating Development DPD which will take forward new allocations and revise existing commercial limits and development limits. Whilst the LDF is still at an early stage, the work and supporting studies undertaken for the Core Strategy, including the Inspector's Report, are material considerations in determining planning applications.

Supplementary Planning Document(s):

- Draft Interim SPD on Developer Contributions for Strategic Transport Contributions at Malton & Norton 2007/8

Local Plan

The site lies within the defined Development Limits for Malton and is adjacent to the Town Centre Commercial Limits and Conservation Area.

Saved Policies:

- H1 – Housing land provision
- H7 – Residential developments within
- R1 – Town Centre Commercial Limits
- R2 – Development for Use Class A3 (food and drink) uses
- R5 – Local daily needs shops within Market Towns
- R9 – Shopfronts
- L6 – New public open space
- L7 – Public open space
- T7 – Parking
- T10 – Public Rights of Way and pedestrian facilities
- ENV7 – Landscaping

Supplementary Planning Guidance:

- Landscaping on Development Sites 2004



Affordable Housing

In accordance with the Affordable Housing Policy (2004) and the Regional Spatial Strategy, the preferred development option will look to ensure 40% of the dwellings provided are affordable units.

Conservation Area(s)

- Malton Conservation Area 3 (adjacent to site)

Listed Buildings

Grade II:

- Spotted Cow Public House
- The Shambles
- 11 Mount Road (adjacent to site)
- 1, 3, 5, 7, 9, 11, 13, 15, 17, 21, 23, 25, 27, 29 Market Place (adjacent to site)

Regional Planning

Regional Spatial Strategy for Yorkshire and Humber

- YH1 – Overall approach and key spatial priorities
- YH2 – Climate change and resource use
- YH3 – Working together
- YH5 – Principal Towns
- YH7 – Location of development
- Y1 – York Area sub area policy
- ENV5 – Energy
- ENV9 – Historic environment
- ENV12 – Regional waste management objectives
- H1 – Provision and distraction of housing
- H4 – The provision of Affordable Housing
- H5 – Housing mix
- E1 – Creating a successful and competitive regional economy
- E2 – Town centres and major facilities
- T1 – Personal travel reduction and modal shift
- T2 – Parking policy

Other Guidance / Related Studies

Urban Capacity Study (2005)

The Livestock Market area was not indicated within this study as it is in active use. Therefore it is defined as a Large Identified Site of Previously Developed Land, which has the potential to contribute to housing capacity as an Unidentified Capacity Source.



Retail Capacity Study (2006)

The preferred development option follows the Study's recommendations, which state that the Livestock Market site is an "excellent opportunity for retail uses, including 'high street' type comparison sector development". The preferred option will also contribute to the proposed policy aspiration to seek to increase the convenience sector retention level within Ryedale's OCA and expand the comparison sector offer.

Malton and Norton Transportation Strategy (2005)

The preferred development option will have some impact on the transportation networks within Malton by closing Spital Street to regular traffic and attracting a greater amount of traffic to the site for parking and use of shopping/leisure facilities. Adjacent to the site is the North – South Spine cycle route. The preferred development scenario will help to address the issues raised within the strategy, in combination with the preferred options for the other sites, of inadequate footpaths within the site and 'chaotic parking'.

Car Park Strategy Report (2005)

The preferred development option will have a beneficial impact on the public parking provision of Malton through increasing the amount of car parking in the town centre, which in turn alleviates pressures elsewhere.

Ryedale Housing Needs & Housing Market Survey (November 2007)

The preferred development option would comply with RDC's housing needs assessment that identifies a need for 18 new affordable units in Malton per annum (9 one or two beds, 9 three or more bed units) and that demand exceeds supply for 2, 3 and 4 bed houses.

River Rail Corridor Study (2004)

The Livestock Market area does not relate directly to the sites identified within the River Rail Corridor Study. However it does meet the needs of the following overarching issues and conclusions:

- Development to be carried out on Brownfield land
- Provision of affordable housing
- Provision of apartments

1.4 PREFERRED DEVELOPMENT OPTION

Description

The preferred development option provides a mix of retail outlets and housing for the Livestock Market area.

Housing would be comprised of two-storey apartments and flats with a new residential area to the south of the new public square. A portion of housing would be affordable. Housing would also be located above shops, cafés and restaurants facing the square, along the north stretch of Spital Street and would front Newgate and Spital Field Court.

Retails units including shops, café's and restaurants would be positioned around the square and along the north stretch of Spital Street and would also front Newgate and Spital Field Court.



The concept is similar to the redevelopment scenario proposed by the Fitzwilliam Estate in 2007, but has some key variations:

- More housing reflecting the market and affordable need identified in Malton.
- Size and number of retail units will differ; in particular the anchor store would suit a 'basket' style food retailer as opposed to a 'trolley' style large supermarket.
- Greater variety of public spaces.
- Spital Street and The Shambles are retained for delivery and servicing access.
- More substantial parking provision via a decked car park, with no underground parking.

If development is to take place, developer contributions will need to be secured to help fund the A64 junction improvements in line with the Draft Interim SPD on Developer Contributions for Strategic Transport Contributions at Malton & Norton 2007/8.

Relocation options for the Livestock Market

Market stays in-situ but reduces in size

This is one option proposed by the tenant, who has indicated that the market would continue to be viable, but there are operational issues to be resolved (e.g. access for HGVs and other vehicles and proximity to residential areas). Fundamentally the ability to significantly alter the retail offer in the town is also reduced and compromised. There have also been circumstances when the proximity of a new market to other uses has been the cause of objections from the Meat and Livestock Commission (Hailsham, East Sussex). Results from the farmers' consultation indicated a 50/50 split between those in favour of this option and those against.

Relocate to Pasture Lane

This option was favoured most by the farmers (60% response) when asked if the market was to relocate, what would be your preferred alternative site. The public supported this option (71% in favour) at the August 2008 consultation event. It is also considered a possibility by both the Estate and the market operators. However there are some issues to overcome to achieve this outcome:

- It requires the release of land defined in the Ryedale local Plan as a "Visually Important Undeveloped Area";
- It is owned by a separate branch of the Fitzwilliam family – the Fitzwilliam Trust Corporation, who would need to grant a long lease to the market operators; and
- It requires a deliverable source of funding. A new market is not viable on its own as the cost of construction is higher than the end value. Enabling development will be required to fund this relocation.

Relocate elsewhere within Malton

If the Livestock Market is not relocated to Pasture Lane it should be relocated within walking distance of the town centre if possible. Potential opportunities closer to the A64 would have reduced linkages to the town centre and would not allow those using the market to easily walk to the town centre shops and services. However, such an option would be preferable to loss of the market from Malton.



Cease Trading

At present this is not an option for the operators who wish to continue in Malton, nor was it an option thought desirable by the farmers in the consultation. This outcome is also likely to be politically unacceptable to Ryedale District Council. However it remains a possible (but unwelcome) outcome as long as the Estate seeks to obtain possession of the current site and the viability of a new market is uncertain.

Factors impacting on relocation

The following issues will guide the selection of a new Livestock Market site taking into consideration a number of factors:

Place and location

The majority of new Livestock Markets are located on out of town sites with limited access to their market towns. However, those which maintain pedestrian access and links to town centres (such as Bakewell, Derbyshire) have proved successful in retaining the market's contribution to the town's character and in terms of financial viability.

A new Livestock Market in Malton should ideally be within reasonable walking distance of the town centre with well signed pedestrian routes and public realm improvements. The Malton and Norton Transportation Strategy already defines the pedestrian and cycle routes throughout Malton and these would need to relate well to the new market. If the new market relocated to Pasture Lane it could utilise the pedestrian routes along Newbiggin, Middlecave Road and from the proposed development at Wentworth Street Car Park.

Funding

The significant funding shortfall is the biggest barrier to the successful relocation of the market. Unlike most other market sites there is little prospect of major direct funding from the sale of the site as the operators do not own the freehold. Funding is likely to be sought from the release of further development land at Pasture Lane for enabling development.

Site availability

As the operators do not own the current site a new site will have to be acquired either on a freehold or a long leasehold basis, probably for a nominal sum (and therefore subject to restrictions on use by way of covenants). The ability to attract investment will be reduced if the site is restricted in its alternative uses.

Planning Constraints

A relocated Livestock Market (and potential additional uses) will need to adhere to current and emerging planning guidance in the form of saved policies set out in the Ryedale Local Plan (2002), the emerging Ryedale Local Development Framework and the Yorkshire and Humber Regional Spatial Strategy. These are addressed in the development brief stage of this Study. This Study, once endorsed by the Council, will be a material consideration in relevant planning decisions, and used as evidence to support work on the Council's Local Development Framework. The Study will also guide the Council's economic development activities and work with partners such as Yorkshire Forward.



Highways and traffic / Parking Provision and Servicing

A relocated Livestock Market will need to accommodate sufficient parking for regular and animal transport vehicles suggesting a site outside of a built-up area. All parking will be accommodated on the site of the relocated market, and should not need to use Wentworth Street car park for additional parking. Access to the site would need to accommodate both vehicular types in modest quantities twice a week and would be suited to a road capable of higher capacities, which potentially includes Pasture Lane, subject to upgrading of the junction with Broughton Road.

The amount of vehicles needing to access the site would vary seasonally. Currently markets are held twice weekly on a Tuesday and Friday, except in the summer months when the Friday market is held every fortnight. Larger sales are held 2-3 times a year to coincide with the farming calendar (e.g. sale of lambs / sheep in the Spring). Current usage of the Livestock Market suggests 50 to 100 movements of vehicles during the morning of the sale with a similar number of return movements later in the afternoon. Movements begin before the morning peak rush hour and finish before the afternoon peak rush hour.

A new Livestock Market on Pasture Lane would need to meet highways requirements and there are capacity issues at the junction of Pasture Lane and Broughton Road (B1257). The Jacobs Report of August 2008 considers that this relocation can be accommodated but would require improvements to the Pasture Lane, Broughton Road junction in the form of mini-roundabouts.

The relocation would be on the same side of the town centre as the current Livestock Market location and no enlargement of the operation is envisaged (unless complementary uses are included for viability purposes). Modelling work has shown that highways issues can be overcome subject to improvements, however this will require close working with NYCC Transport Officers.

Potential key linkages

Market Place

The Livestock Market area and the Market Place sit adjacent to one another with buildings that look out onto both sites. The preferred development options for each site compliment one another and strengthen Malton town centre in terms of the:

- Pedestrian and retail linkages;
- Retail offer and health;
- Public realm and spaces;
- Streetscape and signage;
- Historic built environment; and
- Parking provision.

There is a direct linkage with the Livestock Market area as some of the Market Place's public parking provision, should be offset by the decked car park in the Livestock Market area.





Wentworth Street Car Park

The preferred development options for the Livestock Market area and the Wentworth Street Car Park sites are critical to the regeneration of the town centre. Planning for both sites would be mutually beneficial and would to some extent help define each other through coordinated planning. Further details of this relationship are given below (section 1.5).

Other linkages include:

- Pedestrian and retail linkages;
- Streetscape and signage; and
- Parking provision.

Wheelgate

The preferred options for both sites look to improve the retail environment for the town centre by increasing the retail offer, improving and supporting retail / pedestrian linkages and enhancing the public realm / streetscapes.

Pasture Lane

The ability to secure the Pasture Lane site for the new livestock market (or another suitable site) is fundamental to the progression of the development of the Livestock Market area and the continuation of livestock trading in Malton.

Urban Form

Layout

The preferred development option is centred on a new pedestrian public square that retains Spital Street and the road leading on from The Shambles for service and delivery vehicles. Buildings fronting the square and those north of it contain retail and leisure uses on the ground floor with housing above. The two northern buildings are wrapped around courtyards containing public areas and parking spaces.

South of the square, housing is found on all floors and again both buildings are centred on public courtyards with some landscaping.

Across Horsemarket Road, the decked car park provides parking provision for the site and wider town centre in a sensitively designed structure making use of the topography of the local area. The structure would provide three levels of parking within a two-storey building by making use of a partially sunken ground floor.

Density / Plot ratio

The preferred development option's relatively high density lends itself to this town centre site. The buildings are comprised of 3 to 4 storey buildings that complement the elevated terrain to the west and the buildings fronting the Market Place to the south-east.

Materials

Materials must be chosen carefully to fit in with the existing context. Stone, brick, slate and clay plantile would be appropriate with an appropriate mix of modern materials such as glass, steel and timber cladding. All detailing must be of high quality and in keeping with the surrounding context. There is an opportunity for the residential development to



reflect the Victorian character of existing terraced housing on Horsemarket Road and Victoria Road.

Indicative Plan



Movement and parking

Traffic Management


Spital Street will be closed to regular traffic as part of the pedestrian priority zone. However delivery and servicing traffic with some limited residential traffic will be available to access the site. Modelling work undertaken by Jacobs indicate that this option is feasible, however close working with NYCC Transport Officers is essential to ensure that any proposed scheme are achievable in this respect.

Parking Provision

An indicative 223 parking spaces would be provided within the adjacent decked car park.

Pedestrian Movement

The preferred development option will support the flow of pedestrians around the town centre by taking advantage of the pedestrian connections between the Livestock Market



area and the Market Place. There are numerous passageways between the two sites which potentially could be opened up to public use, in negotiation with the landowner. Through the design of the scheme, use of materials and signage, pedestrians will be encouraged to circulate throughout the site and around to adjacent town centre areas.

1.5 DELIVERY CONSIDERATIONS

The nature and location of the site means that only a scheme that balances the competing demands of retail, residential and car parking will be economically deliverable.

Timescales

We understand that a new lease agreement is being negotiated. We understand that the terms of this proposed agreement provide for a five-year extension to the operators lease with a rolling break clause after two years and a minimum of 12 months as a period of notice. These discussions are welcomed as it allows for a minimum of three years to plan properly for this site and critically address the planning and funding issues that need resolution in order to secure the provision of an alternative site within Malton for the Livestock Market. Our preference is for the relocation to take place on Pasture Lane. At the August 2008 consultation event 70% of respondents supported the proposed relocation of the Livestock Market and additional development to fund the new Livestock Market. 21% disagreed and 9% did not know.

In the event that the development of the Livestock Market area was delayed because a suitable anchor tenant could not be found or there were insufficient supporting retailers and restaurants tenants available to enable a comprehensive development, then there may be pressure for the development to be phased and developed on an ad-hoc basis. However we strongly feel that this should be avoided. We believe it is essential that a comprehensive development of the Livestock Market area is undertaken, given its critical regenerative role for Malton town centre.

Retail Development

In order to attract quality retailers to help address the retail needs identified in the Roger Tyms Retail Capacity Study and Update (2006 and 2008), the scheme must offer flexible shop units which are suitable for a range of operators. It must be expected that significant incentives will be necessary to secure these retailers, but this will have long term benefits for both the scheme and the town.

For the anchor store operator, a small high quality basket store food retailer would typically require circa 7,500 to 12,000 sq ft (gross) of space. A larger supermarket would require a minimum of 20,000-30,000 sq ft (gross) and we believe this would be best accommodated at Wentworth Street car park in terms of transportation and location. Other retailers will require flexibility and it is important to be able to offer a range of units to attract the core national brands as well as offering smaller space for local users of between 1,000 to 4,000 sq ft (gross). Unit size is one way in which tenant mix can be controlled but ultimately it requires a letting policy that meets the town's aspirations as diverse retailers can have similar sized units. There is clear potential for courtyards to the rear of properties fronting Market Place to be opened up in conjunction with redevelopment of the livestock market and so provide more activity on this underutilised area.



The inclusion of a significant residential element will make the scheme more robust in viability terms, as well as providing much needed homes in the town centre. The residential mix is intended to be both saleable and to provide an apartment offer that is not readily available in the town at present. 40% of affordable housing is to be provided with a mix of tenures including shared ownership. The right retail and residential mix will make the provision of the decked car park viable, subject to market conditions.

Retail tenant mix

In order to underpin the feasibility of the Livestock Market area redevelopment, the presence of key multiple retailers with strong covenants will be important.

The tenant mix for the Livestock Market area development needs careful consideration. We consider a high quality basket food anchor would be appropriate. However, a food anchor is not a prerequisite for this site and a non-food anchor would also work on this site depending on highway considerations. Bulky goods retailers would not be appropriate here.

Key Partners

- Ryedale District Council
- Fitzwilliam Malton Estate
- North Yorkshire County Council
- Yorkshire Forward
- Boulton & Cooper Stephenson
- Cundalls
- Selected developer / contractor

Consultation Groups

- Malton & Norton Area Partnership
- Malton Town Council
- Norton Town Council
- Business in Action
- THRIVE
- NFU – local and regional farmers
- Local residents

Phasing and Timetables

Short – Medium Term

| Action | Responsibility |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------|
| Consider application for Livestock Market taking into account the recommendations of this study, including the need for the relocation of the market. We encourage close working between the Fitzwilliam (Malton) Estate and Trust Corporation, market operators and RDC to | RDC/FME |



| | |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------|
| deliver a successful proposal. | |
| Ensure that any proposals are robust in terms of transportation and pedestrian links. | RDC / NYCC |
| Monitor progress concerning tenancy agreements relating to the livestock market tenancy. | RDC |
| Continued liaison with Fitzwilliam (Malton) Estate regarding relocation of livestock market to Pasture Lane. | RDC/FME |
| Consultation with Ryedale Conservation Officer to enable a sensitive proposal to be developed which is sympathetic to the historic character of the surrounding town centre. | RDC |
| Ensure parking provision on this site is considered in context with other parking provision in Malton town centre. | RDC / NYCC |
| Consultation and discussions with NYCC Highways Officers. | RDC / FME/NYCC |

Long Term

| Action | Responsibility |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------|
| Ensure a maintenance agreement is in place to ensure public areas are kept to a high standard. | RDC |
| Continuous monitoring of retail tenants to assess whether retail deficiencies are being addressed and to inform future Retail Capacity Studies. | RDC / FME |